

EVALUATION REPORT

**DECENT WORK AND LABOUR RIGHTS PROGRAMME IN
EAST AFRICA: PHASE 1 (2014 – 2017)**

FORUM FOR INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION



Report prepared by: Kitakaya Loisa

August 2017
Nairobi, Kenya

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	ii
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	iii
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	iv
Component 1	vi
Component 2	vi
Components 1 & 2	vi
Future Management of Programme in the Region	vi
CHAPTER 1: CONTEXTUAL ANALYSIS	1
CHAPTER 2: DECENT WORK AND LABOUR RIGHTS PROGRAMME IN EAST AFRICA...	3
2.1. Component 1: Decent Working Conditions.....	4
2.2. Component 2: Youth Employment.....	4
CHAPTER 3: PARTNERSHIP.....	5
3.1. Trade Unions.....	5
3.2. Youth Organisations.....	5
3.3. Forum for International Cooperation (FIC).....	5
CHAPTER 4: EVALUATION METHODOLOGY.....	7
4.1. Purpose of the Evaluation	7
4.2. Scope of Evaluation.....	7
4.3. Literature Review and Development of Tools	7
4.4. Data Collection.....	7
4.5. Limitations of the Study	8
CHAPTER 5: EVALUATION FINDINGS.....	9
5.1. Implementation of Activities	9
5.2. Choice of Project Sites.....	12
5.3. Relevance	12
5.4. Strategic Partnerships.....	13
5.5. Programme Administration and Quality of Programming.....	15
5.6. Effectiveness.....	15
5.7. Efficiency	17
5.8. Impact.....	18
5.9. Sustainability	20
5.10. Persisting Challenges.....	21
5.11. Reduced Funding and Effects on Programming.....	21
CHAPTER 6: GOOD PRACTICES	23
CHAPTER 7: LESSONS LEARNT	24
CHAPTER 8: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	25
8.1. Conclusions.....	25
8.2. Recommendations	25
8.3. Future of Programme Management in the Region	26
BIBLIOGRAPHY	27
ANNEXES	5
a.) Success Story: Kenya Shipping, Clearing and Warehousing Workers' Union	5
b.) Success Story: Ayu Mlahagwa (26), Tanzania	5
c.) Success Story: Open Mind Tanzania	5
d.) Terms of Reference	5

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author wishes to express sincere appreciation to Forum for International Cooperation officer in Nairobi for their support and extensive comments to ensure that facts on the ground are not missed and the report meets the desired quality standards. In particular, I would like to thank Caspar Pedro, the team leader in Nairobi for going through the earlier drafts of this report with a fine tooth comb and drawing my attention to important aspect that we had earlier overlooked. I am also indebted to Festus Ouko and Joria Sudi for their extensive comments on the earlier drafts of the report.

To the key leaders of partner organisations, workers and youths all drawn from Kenya and Tanzania, thank you for taking time to meet and hold discussions with me. Your comments, sharing and contributions have made this report and the entire evaluation exercise possible.

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AYT	– African Youth Trust
CBA	– Collective Bargaining Agreement
DWLRP	– Decent Work and Labour Rights Programme in East Africa
DWU	– Dock Workers Union
FGD	– Focus Group Discussion
FIC	– Forum for International Cooperation
KSCWWU	– Kenya Shipping Clearing and Warehouse Workers Union
KUDHEIHA	– Kenya Union of Domestic Hotels Educational Institutions Hospitals & Allied Workers
NEC	– National Executive Committee
OECD-DAC	– Organisation of Economic Cooperation and Development – Development Assistance Committee
OMT	– Open Mind Tanzania
SUK	– Seafarers Union of Kenya
TAMICO	– Tanzania Mining Construction and Allied Workers Union
The Programme	– The Decent Work and Labour Rights Programme, East Africa
TMLC	– Tom Mboya Labour College
TYVA	– Tanzania Youth Vision Association
UNESCO	– United Nations Educational Social and Cultural Organisation
YAK	– Youth Alive Kenya
YOA	– Youth of Africa

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIC, several labour unions and youth organisations have been implementing the Decent Work and Labour Rights Programme in East Africa with operations in both Kenya and Tanzania. The programme is focused on building the capacity of these local organisations and thereby enable them to live up to their mandates of representing workers and defending workers' rights and building the capacity of youth organisations to support youth effectively in livelihoods opportunities.

The current Phase of the programme began in 2014. This evaluation examines the Phase 1 of the programme to determine whether implementation was done according to plan, the challenges encountered and their impact so far. To do this the study employed review of literature on the programme and data collection using both focus group discussions and key informant interviews with different stakeholders including field visits to each of the partners in the programme and FIC staff in Nairobi. The FIC project manager based in Copenhagen, Denmark was interviewed via Skype. A limitation to this study was inability to confirm beneficiary data on youth that have landed on jobs. This was mainly because such youths could not secure time off from their employers to have interviews with the evaluator. The number of those who had established or expanded their own businesses was inadequate for a valid sample size.

Overall, the programme has been implemented according to plan with attendant successes and challenges. Implementing partners have engaged in organisational reform processes to revamp themselves, increase accountability, entrench democratic practices and have the capacity needed to deliver on their mandates.

The study found out that the programme is relevant in East Africa and will remain so for a long time to come. Unemployment among youth is high in the four cities of Mombasa, Nairobi, Kisumu and Dar es Salaam. The local education system is white collar jobs oriented while the local economies do not produce the same to match the number of youth joining the labour market. Labour unions too need strengthening because of the employers who are using trickery and other underhand dealings to exploit workers on the one hand, and unions that are too weak and disorganised to stand up for workers in any meaningful way, on the other.

The programme combines capacity building on workers' rights for workers and employability and business skills training for youth with organisational capacity development for both youth organisations and labour unions. The training to individual beneficiaries is important for youth to be innovative and to acquire the skills employers look for. Training on labour rights and governance of unions enables workers to hold their unions and employers to account. The organisational capacity development is equipping the relevant organisations to pursue their mandates more effectively. The two-pronged strategy was found to be effective to a reasonable degree.

Most partners bring specific value to the programme; by the niche associated with either their activities or the specific group they serve. However, the study established that SUK brings little (if any) value to the programme. TYVA is the only organisation doing advocacy among youth organisations in Tanzania. However, without clearly demonstrated outcomes of the advocacy efforts, there is room for TYVA to increase its portfolio by adding to its activities beyond what it currently does.

Key successes

The numbers of workers represented by the unions combined and the numbers of youth reached by youth organisations lend credence to programme efficiency especially in view of drastically reduced administrative costs and lean implementation structures both in Nairobi and Copenhagen. However, it should be noted that the reduction of administrative support is increasingly heading toward an equilibrium beyond which the quality of programming will likely be compromised.

The DWLRP has made significant contributions toward alleviating the situation of unemployed youth in East Africa and improving the working conditions of workers in mainly blue-collar job sectors. Labour unions are more focused in pursuit of their mandates, their operating structures are more streamlined and their new constitutions embrace direct democracy which is a significant shift from the representative democracy which has been highly abused and misused by leaders to load it over workers. It is noteworthy that membership in partner unions has increased with a corresponding increase in revenues and new CBA's of better quality have been signed with different employers, reflecting the improved negotiating skills of union leaders. Youths that have been trained are experiencing a change of mind set and accepting to look for livelihoods within the informal sector, the largest employer in East Africa. Furthermore, internships are proving useful in enabling youth to land jobs faster.

Key challenges

There are some administrative hiccups observed during implementation: unsigned contracts with employees, absence of inception meetings and weak operational planning. While these do not constitute significant breaches, their being addressed would lead to improved quality of programming, administrative effectiveness and compliance with good practices. Other challenges experienced during implementation include: resistance to change, bad politics among trade unions, and constrained training of workers. Despite these challenges, the programme has gone ahead to register impressive results.

The programme has deduced some lessons as well. First, vocational skills enhance the employability of youth. Youth with vocational skills are finding it easy to either start their own businesses within the informal sector or get employed in different sectors of the economy. Business development services are crucial to the survival of youth run businesses in the long term. These would include both backward and forward linkages to producers (suppliers) and markets for products. The study found out that job placements add significant value to any training that youth might undergo.

Robust recruitment and organising strategies are crucial to labour unions expanding and retaining their membership. Even in some unions whose membership had either stagnated or even declined altogether, the implementation of effective recruitment strategies is yielding fruit raising hopes of sustainability of these important organisations.

Overall, organisational development is a long term process requiring patience and persistence before results can be realised at the higher objectives level. This is because organisations create a working culture over time and this is not always easy to change in the short term while having the same people in leadership.

Following findings, we recommend the following key actions:

Component 1

- i. The programme should invest more in the building of systems and structures for the unions to entrench democracy and fiduciary culture.
- ii. The programme should consider a twinning arrangement for unions between strong and weak unions as a form of mentoring and inspiration. This should however be clearly structured and executed properly with due sensitivity to the local dynamics between and within unions.
- iii. The programme should go for strategic and value-adding partnerships and put on hold support to partners who are not keeping their part of the bargain especially implementation of strategic plans.

Component 2

- i. Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) should be incorporated/linked to employability training to give youth impetus when they join the job market.
- ii. Business Development Services (BDS) especially backward and forward linkages should be made accessible to youth through linkages to add value to the current BSED training for youth.

Components 1 & 2

- i. The programme should employ competitive bidding (involving thorough demonstration of capacity and commitment) to identify partners for a significant proportion of its funds and a smaller proportion of funds to designated partners identified through direct negotiations and whose selection should be based on strategic advantage.
- ii. The programme should support partner organisation by developing standard training toolkits especially for unions. The toolkit could be a trainer's case/box fully equipped with standard training materials and teaching aids. This is important for quality control. Such a box could be deposited at the union's office and only borrowed by shop stewards on a need basis.

Future Management of Programme in the Region

- i. FIC should empower its cluster coordinators in two components.
In view of the anticipated closure of the FIC Nairobi office, FIC should have one senior programme specialist who is both technically competent and culturally agile to provide requisite technical backstopping support to coordinators and ensure quality control, while stationed in the region. Such a programme specialist could work from home to avoid paying for office space and receive a retainer instead of a salary.

The more detailed recommendations appear at the end of this report.

CHAPTER 1: CONTEXTUAL ANALYSIS

In **Sub-Saharan Africa**, paid employment opportunities are scarce and the vulnerable employment rate, at 77.4 per cent in 2013, remained the highest of all regions.¹ International mobility of labour through migration is causing pressure in Europe and other developed nations as youth from Africa seek to enter these countries where they deem prospects for decent lives are higher. Unemployment Rate in Tanzania averaged 11.46 per cent from 2001 until 2014, reaching an all-time high of 12.90 per cent in 2001 and a record low of 10.30 per cent in 2014. “Every year it is estimated that **over 800,000 young men and women enter the labour market**. These include school and college graduates most of them migrating from rural areas to urban areas.”² Most of these youths however, have skills that are incompatible with the labour market requirements. There is a mismatch between the skills that youth seeking jobs have and the skills that employers consider employable and are looking for.

Kenya’s population is young and increasingly urbanized. Young people under the age of 15 make up 43% of the population. Youth between the ages of 15 and 34 years constitute another third of the population. With an average of 7.3 years of education, Kenya’s youth are a potential driver of future economic growth, however many lack the requisite skills to contribute to the formal economy. Kenya’s young, educated and vibrant population is hungry for opportunity. “While the national unemployment rate is about 10 per cent, which is high for a country with large informal and traditional sectors, youth unemployment rates are usually much higher. The highest unemployment rates are for people around 20 years old, at 35 per cent.”³

Both Kenya and Tanzania have no legislative provisions for unemployment insurance and benefits. Although a youthful population is considered a formidable asset for innovation and creativity in an economy, failure to harness the potent power of youth can be a recipe to disruptive outcomes. Yet, when youth are engaged civically and afforded the space to achieve their aspirations, they develop a sense of respect, dignity and increased self-efficacy. These in turn lead to a greater supply of social capital and a reduced inclination toward violence and other disruptive behaviour and human trafficking in pursuit of opportunities for a better life. In realisation of this, it is imperative that a majority development partners in Kenya and Tanzania have Country Strategies that prioritise youth engagement for employment creation. These include the European Union (EU), United States Agency for International Development (USAID), Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), etc.

Both Kenya and Tanzania have legal frameworks that are favourable to workers. The Constitution of Kenya (2010) enshrines several labour rights including the freedom of association, independence of social partners, a fair remuneration, reasonable working conditions and the right to strike. Tenets of the Decent Work Agenda are embedded in Chapter Four, also known as the Bill of Rights. There are other supporting legislation including: The Employment Act of 2007, The Labour Institutions Act of 2007, The Labour Relations Act of 2007, The Occupational Health and Safety Act of 2007, The Domestic Workers’ Act of 2011, The National Social Security Fund (NSSF) Act of 2013, etc, make operational the broad stipulations of the constitution.

¹ http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/multimedia/maps-and-charts/WCMS_233936/lang-en/index.htm

² *Ibid*

³ USAID

However, employers are exploiting the desperation for wage earning employment among job seekers, by subjecting them to poorer than legally defined working conditions. This is further exacerbated by the inefficiency of relevant departments of government in carrying out regular inspection of work places to ensure compliance with prescribed Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) standards. Working conditions are monitored by 95 labour inspectors employed by the Ministry of Labour, Social Security, and Services (MLSSS). It equals one inspector per 188,921 workers of the total workforce and 23,849 of wage and salaried employment. In contrast, the ILO recommends one inspector per 40,000 workers in less developed countries. By the same token, low salaries and the lack of vehicles, fuel, and other resources made it very difficult for labour inspectors to do their work effectively and left them vulnerable to bribes and other forms of corruption. Many workers end up working in environments that are dehumanizing, pose health hazards to them and are not adequately rewarding.

Employers have also devised crafty employment arrangements and structures that take away responsibilities from them to third parties to whom they outsource all hiring responsibilities relating to workers below management. The companies that play labour agents are usually difficult to trace since they may not have physical offices in the employees' work place. Workers' efforts to mobilize and organize under the auspices of trade unions are consequently frustrated and scuttled because they are not sure with whom to sign recognition agreements. Kenya was ranked 4 out of 5 of ITUC's Global Rights Index since 2015 and classified with 'systematic violations of rights'. This is interpreted as workers in countries with the rating 4 have reported the government and/or companies are engaged in serious efforts to crush the collective voice of workers putting fundamental rights under threat.⁴

A large majority of workers in Tanzania do not have employment contracts and lacked legal protections. Based on a study by the Legal and Human Rights Centre (LHRC), when companies offer written contracts in compliance with labour laws, they do not fulfil the contracts' terms. For example, 99 per cent of contract documents do not include job descriptions, an omission used to exploit workers.

Where unions exist, employers have been equally shrewd with some sponsoring the election of sympathetic and compliant union leaders that do according to employers' (and not workers') bidding. This is especially true in the case of sectors that employ low-skilled workers with low to no formal education. In these sectors, workers are intimidated, have negative perceptions of trade unions because of deliberate misinformation campaigns and collective bargaining agreements are sometimes not respected by employers. The combination of these factors has weakened unions and many workers are left without effective platforms from which to champion their rights.

⁴ http://www.ituc-csi.org/IMG/pdf/survey_ra_2016_eng.pdf

CHAPTER 2: DECENT WORK AND LABOUR RIGHTS PROGRAMME IN EAST AFRICA

The concept of decent work is something that is too often underestimated. Working conditions affect our way of living and have direct repercussions on our lives and future. Access to decent work is the best way workers can realize their aspirations, improve their living conditions and actively participate in society and in the stimulation of the economy. Every worker, young or adult, has the right to decent work. Decent work revolves around four objectives: creating jobs, guaranteeing rights at work, extending social protection and promoting social dialogue. Experience shows that economic growth, on its own, is not sufficient for meaningful development. Instead, more must be done to empower individuals through decent work, support people through social protection, and ensure the voices of the poor and marginalized are heard.⁵ Decent work is a source of personal dignity, family stability, peace at household, community and the nation at large. Work is the key in poverty reduction and facilities in achieving equitable, inclusive and sustainable development in the country.⁶

The Decent Work and Labour Rights Programme (DWLR), (hereinafter referred to as The Programme) is a response by Forum for International Cooperation to the unsustainably high unemployment levels in East Africa and the wanting working conditions of workers because of labour laws that are not effectively enforced and unaccountable employers. The **overall objective** of the program is “The employment conditions in Kenya and Tanzania have improved and youth has access to decent employment in line with existing national and international labour laws and regulations.”

The **immediate objectives** of the program are:

- i. The strengthened capacity of partner trade unions in Kenya and Tanzania to advocate for and create awareness about workers’ rights and respect of labour market legislation contributes to improved working conditions.
- ii. The strengthened capacity of partner youth organisations in Kenya and Tanzania to create awareness and to advocate for increased and improved job opportunities for youth has contributed to better conditions for establishing sustainable businesses and increased success in their job seeking.

In pursuit of the above goal, the programme adopts capacity strengthening of both youth and workers’ organizations in their quest to advocate and lobby for formulation and implementation of policies and laws that promote increased creation of jobs that meet the threshold of international standards and labour related conventions.

The implementing partners work towards ensuring that labour rights in Kenya and Tanzania are upheld, especially for the vulnerable and poor with low income, that those with little opportunities in society are empowered, and that their conditions and opportunities at the labour market are improved.

⁵ UN Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon, *World Day of Social Justice 2014*

⁶ <http://www.youthemploymentdecade.org/en/repor/youth-unemployment-national-priority-tanzania/>

The program focuses on Kenya and Tanzania in and around bigger cities (Dar es Salaam, Mombasa, Kisumu and Nairobi).

2.1. Component 1: Decent Working Conditions

This component was focused on building the capacity of labour unions to be effective platforms for the articulation of workers' rights and able to live to their mandate. The objective of the Component 1 of The Programme is "The strengthened capacity of partner trade unions in Kenya and Tanzania to advocate for and create awareness about workers' rights and respect of labour market legislation contribute to improved working conditions."⁷ under this component the programme sought to strengthen the organisational capacity (internal governance) of the unions to run a democratic member-based organisations which are able to ensure that the labour market legislation are implemented at the workplaces; shop stewards, union leaders, officials and members of the unions are trained in both union matters, organisational and administrative issues and labour market legislation with the objective of increasing the unions' performance, transparency and accountability towards members. Additionally, the Programme sought to facilitate establishment of committees focusing on a good working environment at the work places, including good health and safety conditions, as well as prevention of discrimination based on ethnicity, sex, gender or age.

At individual union level, the programme supported the establishment of special youth committees which, ensure decent conditions for youth at the work places as well as a stronger involvement of youth in the trade union. It was part of the programme design to escalate initiatives at work place from the local to county and finally to national level to advocate for respect of labour legislation through abolishing of casualization.

2.2. Component 2: Youth Employment

The Component 2 of the Programme was informed by the challenges that youth face as they join the labour market. "Skills development is vital in reducing unemployment, inequality and poverty, and promoting growth. It is also a wise investment. For every \$1 spent on education, as much as \$10 to \$15 can be generated in economic growth." (UNESCO Global Monitoring Report 2012). Youth challenges extend beyond the education sector to include lack of access to finance, insufficient youth-friendly social services, unemployment, lack of internship and skills building opportunities, and a lack of voice in shaping their futures.

The objective of the Component 2 was "The strengthened capacity of partner youth organisations in Kenya and Tanzania to create awareness and to advocate for increased and improved job opportunities for youth has contributed to better conditions for establishing sustainable businesses and increased success in their job seeking". Youth organisations involved in skills training were part of this component.

⁷ Decent Work and Labour Rights in East Africa FIC, Flaglight International Centre, October 2013

CHAPTER 3: PARTNERSHIP

3.1. Trade Unions

In its Component 1, The Programme worked with four trade unions in Kenya: The Dock Workers Union (DWU), Seafarers Union of Kenya (SUK), Kenya Union of Domestic, Hotels, Educational institutions, Hospital and Allied workers (KUDHEIHA), Kenya Shipping Clearing and Warehouse Workers Union (KSCWWU); and a workers' training institution, the Tom Mboya Labour College (MTLC). A common factor among the unions in Kenya is their members working in mostly one region – the coast – and their services revolving around the harbour and related services, and the hotel industry in tourist resort of Mombasa. In Tanzania, the Programme partnered with Tanzania Mining and Construction Workers Union (TAMICO).

FIC has been working with some of these organisations in its previous programmes in East Africa. These include the DWU and TAMICO. Over the years strong relationship and trust developed and the two unions have been fighting privatization in the port of Mombasa in Kenya and eradication of child labour in Mererani mines in northern Tanzania (that has since ended) respectively. The DWU has moved on to addressing better terms and conditions of service for members after privatisation ceased being an issue at the port.

3.2. Youth Organisations

In Tanzania, the main partners in the youth component were Tanzania Youth Vision Association (TYVA), Youth for Africa (YOA) and Open Mind Tanzania (OMT) and Don Bosco Training Centre, all based in Dar es Salaam. TYVA specializes in collecting, organizing and disseminating information on opportunities available to youth. The information meetings are held through mobilization efforts with government youth officers in areas where low income youths live. The information disseminated is usually on labour market training opportunities, business development services and sources of business start-up and expansion capital from the multiple public funds.

YOA on its part provided labour market training to graduate youth after mobilization and information meetings by TYVA. Those youth that had an interest in business went to OMT to receive training in business skills and entrepreneurship (BSED) training. The three organizations worked closely together to complement each other while sticking to their specializations for the benefit of youth.

The main partners among the youth organizations in Kenya were Africa Youth Trust (AYT) and One Stop Youth Centre, Nairobi, with whom FIC has partnered previously. AYT is a leader in BSED training for youth. AYT had already been working with the County Government of Nairobi through OSYC. AYT extended its services to Kisumu through Youth Alive Kenya (YAK) and worked with the County Government of Mombasa in the coastal region. All partners targeted youth from low-income neighbourhoods.

3.3. Forum for International Cooperation (FIC)

FIC, a Danish NGO headquartered in Copenhagen, Denmark has been working for more than 15 years in Kenya and Tanzania in East Africa together with local partners to implement projects within

the following three priority areas⁸: improved employment conditions and increased employment opportunities primarily for young people.

These overarching goals contribute to the improved quality of life of target groups by bringing about labour conditions that enhance and maintain the dignity of workers and by creating more opportunities for incomes for young people who in most economies are almost always the very first casualties of unemployment or poor and dehumanising labour conditions. While income opportunities are fundamental avenues for individuals to work their way out of poverty, the conditions attendant to such opportunities should recognise the labour rights of workers. Any development process and opportunities should enhance the human rights of beneficiaries as individuals and as collective communities of workers.

⁸ For further elaboration of FIC work, please refer to “FIC International Development Strategy”

CHAPTER 4: EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

4.1. Purpose of the Evaluation

The objective of the review is to assess the overall progress of the program results as well as assessing the strategy applied since when the programme phase began in 2014 to its ending in 2017. This review aimed at assessing the impact the programme has had on the lives of the target beneficiaries, decipher lessons learned and best practices that are crucial as the next phase commences, and give direction for scalability and replication. In the end, the exercise is for documentation, learning and accountability.

4.2. Scope of Evaluation

The review focused on all questions derived under the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development – Development Assistance Committee (OECD-DAC) criteria namely: relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. In both components, additional attention is paid to:

- *How does FIC add value to partners work and implementation?*
- *An assessment of the partners' capacity?*
- *Is the capacity of the partners progressing in line with the capacity building activities implemented?*
- *An assessment of the advocacy strategy and the implementation of the same carried out by the partners. Is the advocacy effective, and is it likely to create a future impact?*
- *What lessons can be learned for the future program?*

While all crucial focus areas (relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability) were given due attention, the strategies in place to sustain whatever impact and results that have been realised was interrogated ignominiously. Accordingly, the resource mobilisation capacity of the partner organisations and how they strategically allocate resources to activities that are important to sustaining outcomes were also analysed.

4.3. Literature Review and Development of Tools

Prior to developing tools and the evaluation, the exercise started with a review of all relevant project literature including the initial project proposal, programme periodic reports and organisation capacity reports from different partners and general literature on conditions of workers and youth employment in Kenya and Tanzania. The literature review allowed for good internalization of the programme and informed development of tools. Additionally, the review of literature led to an appreciation of issues to be interrogated in greater detail during field data collection. The documents reviewed appear in the references section of this report.

4.4. Data Collection

The evaluation further analysed programme data and triangulated it with anecdotal evidence in the field. Programme participants – both youth and workers – under both components were interviewed to cross-check the information contained in the various reports reviewed. Data was analysed from each partner organisation.

To collect qualitative data, we conducted interviews with top 15 leaders of trade unions (national executive committee [NEC] members, 5 youth coordinators and 10 shop stewards. Ordinary members of the unions (60 in number) and 60 youth were also met in focus group discussion (FGD) conducted

with them. Under Component 2, interviews were held with staff of youth organisations and government officials affiliated to youth affairs. Focus group discussions were held with beneficiary youth.

4.5. Limitations of the Study

Although due care and effort were exercised during field data collection, there were several challenges that were not always easy to overcome.

- i. The first limitation was getting data to substantiate oral interviews with Tom Mboya Labour College. Triangulation confirmed the qualitative information obtained from the college was faulty thereby rendering the interviews untenable for a factual study. The interviews contained information which informants considered was what the donor wanted to hear but totally different from facts on the ground. Furthermore, TMLC exhibited apathy toward the evaluation especially since it no longer receives funding under the Programme.
- ii. Secondly, except for shop stewards majority of whom are heads of sections in their respective work places, most workers could not be interviewed because they could not get time off work. For others, their lunch break was a much-needed rest between working hours. Workers in the hotel industry are particularly busy during their working hours.
- iii. Thirdly, meeting with beneficiary youth that received training and subsequently landed jobs was not possible. These youths could not get time off from work while other youth had relocated to other cities to pursue different livelihood opportunities. While this is a good problem, it deprived the study of the opportunity to verify information and learn from these successful beneficiaries. Fourthly, interviews with Don Bosco in Dar es Salaam were not conducted because of misunderstanding in communication and subsequent lack of cooperation from the institution.
- iv. Sixthly, interviews could not be held with Don Bosco in Dar es Salaam because of miscommunication between TYVA and Don Bosco about the mission.
- v. Finally, the evaluation took place at a time of low morale among both staff and coordinators most of whom were in search for new employment opportunities in view of the radical changes in the programme. This did not augur well for the whole evaluation exercise.

CHAPTER 5: EVALUATION FINDINGS

5.1. Implementation of Activities

Component 1 & Component 2

All activities under the components were implemented on time to desirable quality standards. However, the training on advocacy was of wanting quality and advocacy activities only picked up late in the programme and only in Kenya when the campaign against casualization of labour got underway especially in the coast region. Training of workers was not implemented very successfully by TAMICO and DWU because of challenges posed by employers to the former and poor organising and political grandstanding in unions. There is a slow pace of implementation in SUK and KSCWWU because of their disadvantaged position of limited capacity at the start of the programme.

Implementation is summarised in the table below:

Intervention Logic	Indicator	Implementation Status
Outcome 1: Effective engagement of employers and governments by trade unions (contribute to improved working conditions and better welfare)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 35 engagement meetings or awareness campaigns towards sector players and employers ⁹leading to improved working conditions ¹⁰ (KUDHEIA 10 and KSCWWU-NAIROBI 2, TAMICO 15, Partners in Mombasa 18) • At least 10 new CBAs leading to improved working conditions¹¹ are signed (KUDHEIA 6, KSCWWU-NAIROBI 1, TAMICO 6, Mombasa, 15) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An advocacy campaign, to open way to engagement, is underway in the Coast region. • The CBAs target has been exceeded.
Output 1.1: Target group and partners have increased capacity to address workers' rights and health and safety issues for improved working conditions including non-discrimination policies	<p>1.1.1 200 shop stewards and union leaders have been trained to address workplace disputes and conflicts (KUDHEIA 62, KSCWWU-NAIROBI 20, TAMICO 40, Mombasa 90)</p> <p>1.1.2 a) 80% of members involved in the program know their rights as workers (80 % of 12860 trained is 10,288 (grievances and conflicts handled at work place level with involvement of shop stewards or work place officials), (Mombasa 5387, KUDHEIA 3600, KSCWWU-NAIROBI, 300, TAMICO 1700</p> <p>b) 20 % less reports on discrimination cases and 10 % of work places has implemented a discrimination policy</p> <p>1.1.3 a) Ensure 70 per cent provision of personal protective equipment at workplaces involved in the program</p> <p>1.1.3 b) 60% per cent use of equipment</p> <p>1.1.3 c) 50 per cent reduction of serious fatal accidents and reportable injuries at workplaces</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Target met • Target not met because of constraints from employers. But for those trained there has been impact on improved conflict resolution, reduced accidents and increased awareness on OSH by demand and use of PPEs. • PPEs provision target met. • 60% use of PPEs achieved. • 50% reduction in accidents achieved.

⁹ National and county governments, employers and employers organizations

¹⁰ Such as better payment, equal opportunities for all, access to decent job possibilities for all groups including youth, better health and safety conditions and less serious accidents and better job security for employees

¹¹ Such as salary increase of at least 10 % and better job security also for casuals who has been employed in the same job for more than 3 month, CBA's established with private and public companies not already having CBA etc.

Intervention Logic	Indicator	Implementation Status
Output 1.2: Unions have increased their capacity to recruit members and negotiate for CBAs which lead to better employment conditions at work places ¹²⁾	<p>1.2.1 The membership of trade unions from private companies has increased by more than 25 %</p> <p>1.2.2. Unions have a clear strategy and implementation plan for their negotiations</p> <p>1.2.3 At least 30 (KUDHEIA'S TARGET IS 10 AND KSCWWU-NAIROBI IS 2, Mombasa 18, TAMICO 13) recognition agreements signed with local companies.</p> <p>1.2.4. Number of CBAs with private and public employers increased by at least 25 %.</p> <p>1.2.5. Improvement of working conditions and salary increase with at least 10%</p> <p>More than 50% of members find unions' work performance satisfying</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Target achieved by KSCWWU. No demonstrated results by other unions. • All unions have negotiation strategies • Achieved. • Achieved • Achieved. CBAs under PSCWWU are yet to be implemented.
Output 1.3: Increased capacity and efficiency of trade unions in advocacy and lobbying for decent working conditions	<p>1.3.1. Existence of a feasible advocacy strategy</p> <p>1.3.2. Yearly advocacy and lobbying activities towards policy makers in 3 counties and 3 cities targeting employers</p> <p>1.3.3 20,000 workers (non-members) including young workers are informed on labour and employment rights and benefits of joining the union (FAMICO 10,000, KSCWWU 6300, KUDHEIA 2000, KSCWWU-NAIROBI 1700)</p> <p>1.3.4. Framework document for continued collaboration between youth and union.</p> <p>1.3.5 3 joint advocacy activities between trade unions and youth organisations</p> <p>1.3.6. Existing membership of young workers is increased with at least 15%</p> <p>1.3.7 At least 10% of young members are actively participating in advocacy meetings. (participation means carry out)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A feasible advocacy strategy implemented belatedly and taking off gradually.
Output 1.4: Improved organisational, financial and administrative procedures in the Trade Unions leading to efficient management of the organisations	<p>1.4.1 Executive committee in each union is overseeing and monitoring the implementation of the unions strategic plan and use of financial resources</p> <p>1.4.2 All involved unions have reviewed their internal operations and structures having in place strategic plans and structures needed to implement the plans</p> <p>1.4.3. All unions have reviewed their financial and administrative procedures having in place financial systems and procedures following good financial practices including yearly audits and regular follow ups by executive committee</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All targets achieved but financial transparency is yet to be an entrenched culture among some of the unions.
Output 1.5: Established governance and structures is leading to Internal transparency and accountability in trade unions involved in the program	<p>1.5.1 Democratic structures and members influence in unions increased 1.Regular annual meetings with participation of at least 90 % of members on branch level conducted.</p> <p>2. Regular democratic elections conducted.</p> <p>1.5.2. Organizational structure with Clear division of roles in place implemented</p> <p>1.5.3 75 % find the unions' level of transparency and democracy satisfying</p> <p>1.5.4 Experiences from the program are collected and disseminated to other trade unions in Kenya</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regular elections being held • Clear roles and responsibilities • No indication that lessons are documented and disseminated to other unions in Kenya

¹² Salary increase especially for low paid groups and job security are enhanced

Intervention Logic	Indicator	Implementation Status
Output 1.6 TMLC curriculum is relevant to current union leadership skill needs in Kenya.	1.6.1 Revised curricula: Courses for trade union leaders and officials developed, based on the needs of the unions 1.6.2 Number of Trade union representatives attending the courses at Tom Mboya Labour college has increased by 60 per cent	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum revised • No data available to show participation in courses.
Output 1.7 organisational capacity of Tom Mboya Labour College to manage capacity building of trade union leadership is enhanced.	1.7.1. Strategic plan in place 1.7.2. Revised structure in place and aligned with strategic plan 1.7.3. Adequate management and teaching staff (capacity of existing structure- number of skills)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strategic plan in place • Structure remains as before • A pool of associate trainers created
Outcome 2: Youth are confidently and effectively engaging employment sector actors through organised platforms leading to increased and improved employment opportunities	8 Advocacy initiatives (campaign forums, etc.) by DWLRP implementing partners through platforms towards employment policies and other interventions (for improved employment opportunities for youth at county and/or national level) At-least 4 youth policy briefs with input from youth on employment opportunities presented to policy makers By 2016 at least 40% of participants on Business Skills Trainings have improved or established a small scale businesses in Kenya and in Tanzania By 2016 at least 30% of participants on Labour Market Trainings have succeeded in getting a job in Kenya and in Tanzania 30 % of trained youth claim to have improved their livelihood ¹³	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved
Output 2.1. Youth have increased skills in business start-up and expansion and search for employment	2.1.1 35,000 youth in Kenya and 15,000 in Tanzania have been informed on labour market opportunities through information activities 2.1.2 3,100 youth in Kenya and 1,500 youth in Tanzania trained in BSED 2.2.2 50% of the youth trained in BSED skills receive mentorship to further develop and implement tailor made business plans 2.1.3 3,100 youth in Kenya and 1,500 youth in Tanzania trained in Labour Market/Employability 2.1.3. B 50% of the 3,100 youth in Kenya and 1,500 youth in Tanzania trained in labour market skills are linked to career guides and develop personalized job hunting strategies/plans 2.1.4 C 25% of participants on labour market training courses have been linked to internships	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved
Output 2.2: Functional and sustainable youth advocacy platforms	2.2.1 Youth organisations/platforms have a robust advocacy strategy for engagement with labour market players	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved
Output 2.3: Enhanced capacity of 6 implementing partners and relevant local and county government staff for smooth implementation and sustainability of program activities	2.3.1 Internal organizational, financial and governance structures and systems of the implementing partners are well-functioning 2.3.2 Existence of the program's activities sustainability strategy/plan 2.3.3 Partners are mainstreaming program activities(e.g. Info mtgs; BSED & LM trainings, etc.) within their work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved

¹³ Livelihood is defined as: "Livelihoods comprise the capabilities, assets (including both material and social resources) and activities required for a means of living" (Chambers and Conway, 1992)

5.2. Choice of Project Sites

The DWLRP was implemented in the four East African cities of Nairobi, Mombasa, Kisumu (all in Kenya) and Dar es Salaam in Tanzania. The three cities attract large populations of unemployed youth because of the rural urban migration as well as the presence of many educational institutions that graduate students annually. The high youth unemployment rate is related to long-term population changes, e.g. young Kenyans and young Tanzanians are moving from rural to urban areas in large numbers. Albeit there has been some increase in urban formal job creation in the two counties, it has been insufficient to cover the demand. It is important to realize that the urban areas have not only been unable to generate sufficient jobs in the formal sector, but also many cannot readily find an adequate occupation in the informal economy. The choice of the four cities for project sites was informed by data on unemployment as these cities represent the job market nexus of the region.

5.3. Relevance

Component 1

The law provides for unions as instruments and institutions through which employees can effectively agitate for their rights. Evidence points to the violation of those rights. The violations arise out of low level of awareness of labour rights among workers and/because of weak unions. In some instances, there is a tendency among union leaders to form alliances with employers who compromise them in the process rendering them unable to stand up for workers' rights. It is therefore justified that the programme sought to empower labour unions targeting the leadership and ordinary workers as well as the organisational development of the labour unions. The trickle-down effect of the capacity building was important considering that the workers whose rights are being violated are the ones bearing the bane of unions that are unable to defend them.

Component 2

When Tanzania changed from a social oriented economy to a market economy, there was no adequate preparation to inculcate a capitalist mind-set in the population. In policy, the government and leaders were being capitalists but the public remained stuck in a socialist time warp. The government started to sensitize the public on the market oriented economy. This happened in the decade 1995 to 2005. In the past, the citizens were waiting on the government to hand them opportunities. This had to change and it has. The training of the youth through the programme is therefore relevant and it is aiding in transforming the mind-set of youth under the new economic orientation.

Information on youth programmes and services within and outside government in the two countries is scattered and disjointed. For example, there are about 19 separate funds that target youth in Tanzania under the auspices of the National Economic Empowerment Council (NEEC). In Kenya, the national government and some county governments such as Mombasa have set up funds for youth and other disadvantaged groups. Organising and packaging this information and disseminating it to youth through relevant channels are imperative. Youth from low income neighbourhoods usually do not have knowledge of the existence of these programmes and initiatives, and where they are aware they do not know how to access them or lack the confidence on accessing and utilising them.

The skills the youth are receiving are relevant in Kenya as well. A challenge that many youth in the country face is transiting from school/college to employment because of the discord between what is taught and what industry seeks. The training has come in handy to enable unemployed youth increase

their economic prospects through skills development and access to finance to create economically viable micro enterprises, self-reliant community level economic development projects and employment opportunities.

The challenge for employers in both technical and non-technical sectors of the two economies has been the absence of a skilled workforce that can adapt to new and more challenging job roles. Vocational skills training of the kind conducted by Don Bosco in Tanzania equips students with specialist knowledge, practical skills and the understanding they need to progress along their chosen learning and career paths.

5.4. Strategic Partnerships

Component 1

Overall, all partner trade unions bring certain value to the programme by virtue of the type of workers they represent – low skilled labour within poorly organised or difficult to organise sectors, a factor that makes them strategic. For example, TAMICO on its part has been working with employees in the construction and public works sector in Tanzania, which is currently dominated by Chinese companies that are reputed to have little regard for workers' rights.

KSCWWU advocates for workers in one of the most challenging sectors in Kenya: they are unskilled and poorly educated and their rights are among the most breached by employers bent on subverting labour laws. The sector has a strong presence in Mombasa because of all the port related clearing and forwarding jobs and warehouses.

On its part, KUDHEIHA represents domestic workers, support staff in hospitals and non-teaching staff in schools and workers in the hotel industry. These groups have no voice because of their lack of specialised skills within their sectors. It is noteworthy that these unions have a strong presence in Mombasa and the coastal region of Kenya because of either port related sectors of the economy or the hotel industry which is strong in the resort city of Mombasa. However, in the recent years, the hotel sector has suffered a decline because of fluctuations in tourism exacerbated by acts of insecurity which has in turn fuelled poor working conditions and job security in hotel business.

However, the strategic value of SUK as a partner in the programme is not clearly demonstrated. It has no employed members, very few active workers, has no recognition agreements with employers and it does not have capacity to implement activities. SUK has not demonstrated any significant impact the programme has had on it or whether the situation would have been any different had it not been part of the programme. Given the resources and time that has gone into the SUK, it could be a lost opportunity where the programme could have partnered with a different organisation for greater impact. Although SUK could be a value adding partner if it brought in new members, there prospects of the union to do that are simply minimal.

Component 2

The partner youth organisations in the programme are grassroots organisations with a strong presence in the communities through other youth networks and structures. This factor enhances the ease of targeting by the partners and speed of outreach. However, the role played by TYVA is rather non-optimal, because mobilisation through existing networks and structures and dissemination of

information through public meetings are relatively easy tasks. By comparison, in Kenya, AYT is doing mobilisation, dissemination of information and delivery of training. In addition, it is important that the programme is able to measure the impact of activities conducted by TYVA such as advocacy campaigns in both the short and long terms. There is therefore an opportunity for TYVA to improve its role in the programme by adding to its portfolio of services with initiatives whose effect is easier to measure.

Across the two components, stakeholders felt that the current partnership between FIC and implementers is not based on competitive selection or bidding by applicants where only the best get to be part of the programme. Instead, FIC identifies organisation, approaches them and they enter into partnership. The approach is prone to complacency and entitlement among implementing partners. This approach further deprives FIC of the opportunity to attract the most serious and determined organisations into partnership. The scenario would have been different if part of the funds were applied for through competitive bidding and a smaller proportion reserved for direct negotiations with select partners deemed strategic.

It was also a view of the stakeholders that in the current partnership between FIC and implementers, the coordinators are not appraised fully on the terms and conditions of the partnership. For example, they are not aware of standard operating procedures commonly agreed between FIC and grant recipients on procurement, use of savings from the different budget lines, and clear sets of do's and don'ts to guide the relationship. Although FIC asserts that these issues are handled during the early stages of implementation through the steering committee, the lack of knowledge nevertheless allows for different interpretations of facts and creates more differences over a matter rather than bringing parties together. In any case, it was the view of some stakeholders that political negotiations should not take precedent over laid down procedures as this would lead to reduced formality in the conduct of business.

The Tom Mboya Labour College (TMLC) in Kisumu has been one implementing partner for the programme. The institution owned by the Kenyan workers through the Central Organisation of Trade Unions (COTU), offers training in industrial relations. For a long time the TMLC was the only institution offering such courses in the region, before some universities started offering degree programmes. Nevertheless, there is still no institution that rivals TMLC in terms of specialisation and mandate and the proportion of activities that are targeted toward trade unions. Through the programme, TMLC received support for organizational capacity strengthening that included review of governance, finance and administration, curriculum, development of strategic plan and creation of a pool of trainers for its various labour related courses. However, TMLC was dropped from the programme after these activities had been implemented. The dropping out of TMLC from the programme deprived the programme of a strategic advantage of impacting on the entire labour fraternity in Kenya (and the larger Eastern and Central Africa region) through the one and only institution mandated to conduct labour training for trade unions. Further, the sudden termination of partnership between FIC and TMLC deprived the latter of the chance to report on immediate impact thereby making it difficult for the programme to determine the sustainability of the activities already undertaken and their effects.

5.5. Programme Administration and Quality of Programming

Stakeholders consistently expressed the need for FIC to act on the reports that are produced (quarterly reports, evaluation report, etc.) and use the input in these documents to adapt both the 'what' and the 'how' of its interventions. The contention of the stakeholders is that they give their input in these reports, and consider these reports to be of value if implemented.

At the time of writing this report, one coordinator did not have a contract with the relevant trade union but continued getting a salary. This is an innocent mistake without any questionable intent but nevertheless an administrative lapse that could result in audit queries. It falls short of good practice in financial and human resource management practices. Furthermore, where there have been contracts, there are no clear human resource management policies on training and staff development, staff appraisals and performance evaluations.

Similarly, the limited level of knowledge among project coordinators in the field on policies and clear contractual provisions that guide and govern the relationship between FIC and partners, has not made it easy for the latter whenever partners have engaged in practices deemed to violate the established norms, e.g. diversion/misuse of funds. This lack of knowledge on the part of coordinators creates a lacuna that partners could exploit and get away with misdeeds.

The evaluation established that there are cases of double counting in beneficiary data. For example, the beneficiaries met during a visit to TYVA were the same beneficiaries met during a visit to YOA. In effect, the two organisations could be referring to the same individuals in their beneficiary data. The evaluation also found out that in some instances the individuals referred to in TYVA, OMT and YOA in beneficiary data, are actually the same individuals. Data management is at the centre of the monitoring and evaluation function of the programme, and needs to be addressed to dispel any fears over the integrity of the data.

5.6. Effectiveness

Component 1

Gradually, the partner unions are becoming strong with the leaders exuding better confidence even though the pace of their progress is wanting. Several new CBAs have been secured by KSCWWU and KUDHEIHA. Recruitment strategies being implemented are producing resulting leading to an increase in union members and in turn increased financial resources with which to conduct business and keep unions functional. However, employers are using every available means to render unions impotent. They are corrupting and compromising union leaderships, they are sponsoring revolts and elections against union leaders that they perceive to be pro-workers and they are using delaying tactics and lame excuses when shop stewards ask for time to train fellow workers. Above all employers are using excuses not to implement collective bargaining agreements (CBAs) even after they have been signed after protracted negotiations. This is the case with the KSCWWU. Similarly, in TAMICO, more than two years after shop stewards have been trained they remain unable to deliver training to workers in the work places because of lame excuses by employers. In addition, employers are outsourcing labour services to ruthless individuals and mysterious organizations to escape the responsibility when labour issues are at stake. The capacity of labour unions to engage employers is therefore a crucial factor.

On their part, unions sometimes practice negative politics which makes the union leadership dysfunctional. For example, leadership wrangles within the DWU have made the NEC unable to hold meetings and execute important business of the union in service to members e.g. obtaining clearance for the shop-stewards to carry out awareness creation sessions at workplace was a failure. Although the wrangles in TAMICO might, on the surface, be perceived as competitive democracy and accountability, they have in the end held the union hostage and it is unable to conduct important business in line with its mandate. There thus have been a disconnect between the top leadership who are preoccupied with political grandstanding and the shop stewards with whom they should work to coordinate capacity building for workers.

Even though there is increased dynamism in unions' leadership, the leaders remain beholden to intransigent employers and mysterious labour agency companies. In the case of DWU, the employer has intimidated most workers by firing the entire top brass of the union. Employers are not implementing CBAs signed with KSCWWU and they are doing so with impunity. They have indeed been avoiding implementing the CBAs for years now.

Advocacy in the programme started late but its implementation was on course by the time of this evaluation. So far the campaign has created awareness using information, education and communication (IEC) materials such as reflector jackets with messages, pamphlets and flyers and use of social media. The on-going advocacy efforts against casualization at the Kenya coast are drawing the support of workers across the coastal region and across sectors. The campaign has excited interest among workers who have been victims of unfair labour practices. These workers are determined to sign a petition to protest casualization and stop it all together. It is worth noting that the communities in the coastal region are supportive of the campaign. The unions have come together to run the campaign and common efforts are proving more effective than individual action. It is yet to be seen how the programme will harness the energy and optimism of the campaign to a fruitful end. It is important that in the next phase of the programme that the momentum of this campaign is maintained and progress monitored and assessed at every stage for effective directing and actualisation of objectives.

Component 2

Judging from the number of beneficiary youth that are landing jobs and or starting or expanding own businesses, the BSED and employability training and internships have brought about the desired outcomes. Youth going for internship opportunities after employability training are getting employed sooner than their colleagues that have not gone for any internship.

Youth that have undergone BSED training reported expansion of their businesses because of better business management skills and record keeping. Those whose businesses failed before training went back confident after training, set up new businesses and their businesses are showing better survival rates. However, some youth that have received training but do not have vocational skills in a particular trade, are still unable to start businesses compared to those that have some vocational skills. Possession of vocational skills in addition to BSED training, enhances the chances of one starting own business or getting employed.

Quality of Training

When training is offered under the two components, the trainers are often professional experienced trainers at the initial trainer-of-trainer's level. Subsequently, it is either a youth training fellow youths or it is a shop steward training workers in his department. Transmission of knowledge is therefore varied and (actually) so is the message ultimately delivered, and therefore (the effectiveness) of the training. There is need for the programme to introduce some quality control by standardization. This could easily be realized through standard training tools in both components.

5.7. Efficiency

Component 1 & 2

Between 2014 and 2016, the amount of funds retained by the FIC Nairobi office has been increasing from 21% of the total receipts to 30.55% in 2016. According to FIC Nairobi office, as activities increased, the amount incurred on capacity building and monitoring increased. Further, funds allocated for conducting annual evaluations, annual partners' meeting and auditing costs on behalf of the partners in the program were also retained at the FIC Nairobi. Below is a tabulation of receipts by the FIC Nairobi office and amount retained.

Income Received	2014	2015	2016	2014(%)	2015(%)	2016(%)
Partner Disbursements	36,248,282.00	49,495,134.00	52,631,360.93	78.74	70.22	69.45
FIC Retained	9,784,980.00	20,987,384.00	23,152,071.93	21.26	29.78	30.55
Total Receipts	46,033,262.00	70,482,518	75,783,432.86	100	100	100

In view of the explanation given, a significant and reasonable proportion of the funds disbursed to FIC Nairobi officer are ending up directly with the unions. However, there is need for FIC to ensure that the costs of its operations including remain at no more than 25% of the programme budget. Technical assistance activities, evaluation and auditing can always be charged to the partners despite such amounts being retained and paid directly from FIC office in Nairobi.

Component 1

In view of the challenges that unions are facing especially KSCWWU and SUK, the return on investment remains low. The capacity of leaders in KSCWWU is wanting and so is their system of leadership. After four years of support and implementation, the leadership of these organisations has not changed any significantly both in terms of visionary leadership and inspiration of members, with significant proportions of members lacking confidence in their leaders. Even of more concern is the fact that there seems to be no likely drastic change in the two unions in the near future. It is noteworthy that KSCWWU has been poorly in holding employers accountable in both dispute resolution and implementation of CBAs. Unfortunately, the leaders of this union are not showing any signs of rising to the occasion and standing up to employers on behalf of the workers.

Away from the chronic governance and leadership issues in the KSCWWU, their funds burn rate is low. It is therefore unable to absorb much in terms of finances within shorter time periods. The unions has been finding it a challenged to execute all activities planned for a given period and reporting judiciously through both narrative and financial reports.

Component 2

Youth organisations have models that allow them to reach large numbers of youth at minimal cost. Achieving those numbers has not been a problem. However, there have been challenges of numbers of participants per training reducing once youth learn that they will not be paid to attend the training. Nevertheless, the large numbers that have been taken through training, in our view, justify the cost invested.

5.8. Impact

Component 1

Partner unions have all reviewed their constitution even though the process is in different stages for each union. Constitutions form the foundation of sound operations of institutions. The reform has led to improved good governance and expanded democratic space for members, at least in theory. The unions have reviewed their election systems from delegate approach to direct participation that allow better exercising of rights by members. Leadership structures have also been made more accommodating to different categories of members and their interests. Youth, women and persons with disabilities are now enjoying better representation and unions are picking on issues affecting these groups.

Following formulation of strategic plans, all partner unions are more professional and focused in their activities and operations. Above all unions are implementing strategies that were selected carefully through technical support from the programme. The strategies are expected to lead to enhanced operations, improved membership and overall aid the unions in being better at living to their mandates. For KUDHEIHA, the current strategic plan developed with support from the programme is its first in the 70 year history.

192 shop stewards and workers representatives trained across the participating unions. A post training assessment indicated they had increased their capacity to address workplace disputes, conflicts and improve working conditions for workers. During the life of the programme unions managed to secure the signing of new collective bargaining agreements (CBA) for their members: KSCWWU 4, KUDHEIHA 8, TAMICO 1, and DWU 2 CBAs. Because of training the quality of CBAs has improved significantly from previous ones. They are more comprehensive and technically competent.

Across the unions, there is increased membership therefore increased financial resources since the two are directly related except for SUK. This arises out of effective recruitment strategies supported by the programme. For example, KSCWWU has increased its membership threefold from an all-time low of 250 to 750 members and its revenues rose proportionately from KES 62,000 per month to KES 150,000 per month. Increased members and revenues have in turn created new buoyancy among the respective unions with enhanced capacity to execute mandate. An increased membership implies an increased-out reach.

SUK's membership has also increased; however, this is a natural trend whenever there are scholarships from the Kenya Maritime Authority (KMA) for its numbers to rise and reduce later. This is growth arises out of external factors and therefore not attributable to the programme nor is it because of any recruitment drive. The training received so far by the SUK is yet to translate into less conflicts, adherence to good financial management practices and increased involvement with stakeholders especially the companies with operations in the high seas.

Members of TAMICO and KSCWWU are now aware of the importance of personal protective equipment (PPEs) and are demanding them from employers. This follows training by shop stewards. In turn, the employers are responding positively. This in turn has reduced the number of accidents in the work places.

At organisational level, each partner union now has a revised constitution and a strategic plan to guide its operations in the short term. The revised constitutions embody direct universal suffrage in elections which is superior democracy than representative democracy characterised by a delegates system, a key feature of old constitutions. The strategic plans, too, provide focus for leaders. However, evidence shows good quality and clearly defined plans but less political will on the part of the unions to implement them to the full. This is particularly the case with DWU and KSCWWU.

In KUDHEIHA, there is increased confidence and taking of responsibility among union members who are now involving themselves more in the activities of the union through different committees. KUDHEIHA has set up a strategic plan monitoring process (with an in-built incentive system) to ensure delivery on targets. It is notable KUDHEIHA is having the first strategic plan since its establishment. KUDHEIHA has embarked on creation of systems that did not exist previously. Chief among this is development of a finance and administration manual and formation of a finance committee, organising committee and recruitment team. The same is true for SUK and KSCWWU who conducted their elections under new constitutions and have formed gender committees. The unions in Mombasa are also adhering to statutory requirements on employee deductions. A case in point is KSCWWU which has formally effected statutory deductions on its workers' pay and remitting them to government.

Component 2

In Kenya 3,243 youth received employability skills training through sessions organised in Nairobi, Mombasa and Kisumu. In Tanzania, 60 trainings were conducted reaching 1,650 youth who received employability skills training. This represents a surpassing of target. 774 (25%) of youth trained in employability skills landed jobs while in Tanzania 250 (16%) youth trained in employability skills got employed.

In both Kenya and Tanzania, the program has put in place strategies to increase the level of results by incorporating job placement services and reviewing the employability model. In Kenya 965 (31%) youth trained in employability landed internships while in Tanzania 375 (25%) youth trained in employability landed internships.

AYT has introduced changes to its governance structure: it now has a constituency it reports to. AYT is in the process of instituting a policy to leverage on volunteer services and interns as a key resource. Youth organisations in Tanzania have put in place administrative systems and some like OMT retained their good rating following assessment by a United Kingdom (UK) based organisational capacity assessment accreditation entity, Molly. YOA's internal control has improved: accounting procedures/financial manual, and a human resource manual are now in place. Generally, youth organizations in Tanzania are now compliant with all statutory requirements: they are now registered

with the registrar of NGO's in Tanzania; they carry out annual audits and filing audit reports with the registrar.

5.9. Sustainability

Component 1

Training for the unions targeted both the leadership where they were equipped with skills of engagement with employers, union management and broadening of their world while at the helm of their organisations. Shop stewards were targeted as well with the expectation that the knowledge will trickle down to the general union membership (workers) a factor which in the long run will guarantee the continued entrenchment of democratic practices in the unions. All these were done within the broader framework of organisational development. The ultimate expected result being improved working conditions for workers in line with the law and economic dictates. The training took place within the broader organisational development framework for each union. These factors combined are enabling conditions for sustainable organisations.

Following reviews, most union constitutions among programme partners now allow for direct democracy. However, KSCWWU has not finalised formalizing the changes in its constitution through the established legal channels. In that case the changes instituted, have not, legally speaking, taken place and the valid constitution remains the old one. However, for the unions that have formalised changes in their constitutions, the changes are sustainable since they are anchored in the overriding governance tool.

Labour unions have immense potential for financial self-sufficiency if they can recruit in large numbers and retain members who promptly remit their contributions. Throughout the partner unions, recruitment and organising is accorded attention and executed with commitment. Yet financial self-sufficiency can only become a reality if there is financial accountability and prudent financial management and service to members. Prudent and proper financial management in line with the aspirations of the current strategic plans that unions have would mean proper allocation of resource to the deserving cost centres of the unions. In the absence of these values and practices as part of the organizational culture, financial sustainability would remain pipe-dream to most unions.

However, after years of partnership with FIC and success in fighting privatization (with associated job losses) at the port of Mombasa, the DWU seems to be sliding back to its earlier status. While financial liquidity is not a challenge, the prevailing limited financial transparency could be a pointer to future problems. Further, the political grandstanding in the unions is holding it at ransoms and training of workers is being affected negatively.

Component 2

Youth networks are the chief sustainability strategy of the programme as well as a diversified resource base for youth organizations. In Tanzania, there are indications that partners are devising innovative strategies to broaden their resource base and work toward financial sustainability in the long run. OMT runs a financial network (revolving savings and credit scheme) where beneficiaries of BSED training can apply for loans to start/expand their businesses. YOA runs an annual event through schools. The event serves as a fund-raiser and a way of reaching out to more youth. AYT remains heavily reliant on

donor funding but the changes it has introduced to its board are likely to positively impact on its sustainability strategies for the future.

Across the two components a more long term, structured and formalised approach to organisational development as evidenced by the existence of strategic plans for all partners has been underway in the programme. Organisational strengthening is a crucial feature that contributes to and includes sustainability of outcomes. Most importantly, partners are implementing their strategic plans with commitment and dedication.

5.10. Persisting Challenges

Component 1

i. Resistance to change:

Despite the positive changes registered among partner labour unions, some challenges persist. First there is resistance to change on the part of top leadership and the TMLC. The new constitutions and strategic plans route for transparency and accountability and supremacy of members. In practice, however, the financial records from these institutions have been inaccessible and this creates a notion of absence of transparency in financial matters. Cases in point are the TMLC, the DWU, TAMICO and KUDHEIHA. This is a perpetuation of the long-standing attitude among unions to resist change. Even though KSCWWU has revised its constitution it is yet to obtain a certificate of registration after filing the new constitution with the registrar.

ii. Bad politics in trade unions

As earlier indicated, TAMICO and DWU have slowed down on their activities because of differences between leaders. Politics characterizes unions in general but lack of common vision that allows forward movement of the union is destructive and tragic. There is delayed implementation of programme activities because of disagreements and political grandstanding between leaders.

iii. Training workers is constrained

Training at the work places is not always effective enough in places like the KPA where the working environment is very structured and near mechanical. Workers and KPA would prefer that training is done outside (with refreshments and other incentives) for maximum concentration and impact. It was observed during the evaluation that training activities were done independent of related activities such as the elections calendar in the case of unions. When activities are carried out but tied to the major events taking place in the larger organisation, the relevance of such training is appreciated better by workers.

There is need for flexibility to balance where training takes place.

5.11. Reduced Funding and Effects on Programming

FIC's main office is in Copenhagen, Denmark, where seven employees have been supporting the implementation and administration of the projects and programmes in Denmark, Europe and Africa. The staffs consist of four project managers two of whom oversee the projects/programmes in East Africa (East Africa Office), a secretary, a financial manager and a director. The East Africa office in Nairobi has four employees: two project coordinators (one for each of the two components), a finance and administration officer and an office assistant.

In response to cuts in donor funding, FIC has taken several painful measures to streamline its operational and organisational capacity to reduce costs. The staff in Copenhagen has been reduced to two only: one in charge of administration and a director who oversees implementation of programmes. The FIC office in Nairobi is expected to close during the last quarter of 2018. All current contracts for Nairobi staff not renewed. This poses two challenges that FIC should address.

First, the staff morale is now low. All are searching for other opportunities. This has the possible effect of impacting negatively on the quality and pace of implementation in the countdown to the office closure. Staff motivation is a force that is directed by the behaviour of people. It is thus a major factor that determines employees' means of satisfying their needs to improve their job performance. Motivation is neither coercing nor persuading people to do what they should, but rather it is a process of creating organizational conditions that will enable employee to strive for superior performance. This is currently not the case in FIC in Nairobi and among coordinators in the field.

A second factor is the management of the initiative after closure of the Nairobi office. While distant management and regular meetings with partner organisations through Skype and occasional field visits by representatives from Copenhagen present some of the obvious options, dealing with unions that are highly political organisations requires hands-on presence and senior representation in the region. For example, as indicated earlier, differences among leaders in DWU have brought the organisation activities to a halt in terms of implementing its activities for this year. For example, TMLC's inability to substantiate its information and unwillingness to share data casts doubt on its accountability. The programme and or FIC can handle this matter by following closely through carefully negotiated interactions. For that reason, the termination of partnership could have been a little too early. The relationship could have continued to be natured even where there is no funding. Funding would however give FIC more leverage to influence positive changes in the TMLC for the benefit of the labour movement fraternity in the country and the region. Additionally, change of organisational culture only takes place in the long term. .

Weak unions such as SUK and KSCWWU would require constant nudging for them to act. However, FIC should consider the needs of a partner alongside their ability to effect meaningful change by over the funding period. So far, SUK's inability to effect any changes in CBAs signing and raising its membership undermines what would otherwise have been the full impact of the programme.

Similarly, since youth are highly mobile before they settle down in life, organisations that are run by young people are also a challenging lot to deal with. This review found out office bearers in both YOA and TYVA were all new after the previous ones left following the end of their terms. This could pose capacity challenges to the nascent organisations and thereby affect implementation of the programme. There is the risk of partners employing shortcuts in implementation in view of the many changes that take place. This can only be managed from a close distance.

CHAPTER 6: GOOD PRACTICES

There are several good practices emanating from the programme that are worth further scrutiny by FIC before possible replication. These include:

i. Implementation of strategic plans

The rather impressive organizational development observed among implementing partners is attributed to their having guiding frameworks in the form of strategic plans. For some of the partners this structured futuristic focus was a new experience altogether. Yet, the plans provide a systematic way of thinking and managing the organisation. Certainly, with strategic plans the leaders are better in leading because of a guiding vision that enjoys the goodwill of members and staff.

ii. Recruitment strategy

From this study, it is apparent that one of the factors that had for long hindered the growth of partners is lack of well thought out organising strategies. With the recruitment strategies being implemented by partners in both components, the numbers of their members are increasing and quality of services rendered to members is improving. This is true even for youth organizations.

iii. Joint Advocacy Efforts

Joint advocacy efforts against casualization of labour are an innovation of the programme. Although the efforts are yet to crystallize into some concrete action by either government or employers, it is already generating great interest and hope among workers. That all casual workers across sectors and industry can be part of this campaign makes it win even more support by marshalling larger numbers.

CHAPTER 7: LESSONS LEARNT

i. Recruitment and organising strategies work

The implementation of recruitment and organising strategies for unions has proved viable when carefully design and judiciously implemented. Through these unions have been able to recruit new members and retain old ones. Recruitment for weak unions is not a lost cause after all.

ii. Changes in unions (political organisations) can take long to be realised

Organisational culture can be strongly entrenched and changing it can only happen over time. This is especially true of trade union which are political organisations characterised by competition, partisan attitudes and deep vested interests from workers, leaders and employers. Results should be expected to be gradual.

iii. Job placements enhances employability

An important value addition to labour market training is job placements for youth. What youth require at the beginning of their careers in only a stepping stone that could serve as an entry point for them. Job placements sever just that purpose and many youths are getting to kick-start their career this way.

iv. Vocational skills training adds value to BSED

In Tanzania, it has become clear that youth with vocational skills are able to start own businesses and or get wage paying jobs if they possess vocational and technical skills.

CHAPTER 8: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8.1. Conclusions

Overall, the DWLRP was implemented according to plan and was largely able to realise desired impact. However, the capacities of partner unions were a limiting factor. In the youth component, slowed economic growth was a limiting factor. In both components, however, there is need for more strategic partnership that can deliver the best value for money. SUK should be able to demonstrate its relevance and value to the programme and TYVA has capacity to do more than information meetings and advocacy only.

While the programme has been pursuing decent work, employers are resorting to more sophisticated methods to counter the power of labour unions and in the process denying workers their rights. The unions are unable to match the craftiness of employers and workers are losing out. Stronger advocacy efforts are needed through the coming together of many players within and outside of the programme.

The organisational capacity development strategy in the programme is creating a network of local organisations with the necessary capacity to pursue their mandates. There exists immense potential for these organisations to build synergy among themselves for the better good of the overall programme.

The challenges of poor life-skills which youth joining the labour market in East Africa face is rooted in the theoretical education systems and rote learning that characterises the two countries, making educational reforms the focus of long-term planning in the larger education sector and skills development.

8.2. Recommendations

In view of the above findings and conclusions based on those findings, we recommend as follows:

8.2.1. Component 1

- i. The programme should focus on building the systems and structures of partner unions in order to influence long term systemic change.
- ii. Unions should seek strength in numbers through advocacy and lobbying for political support to counter employers. Weak unions such as KSCWWU should call upon the support of their affiliate bodies such as the Central Organisation of Trade Unions in Kenya (COTU) and others should do similarly.
- iii. TAMICO should support its shop stewards and liaise closely with employers for the latter to allow employees time off to be trained by shop stewards at the work places.
- iv. The programme should go for strategic and value-adding partnerships and put on hold support to partners who are not keeping their part of the bargain especially implementation of strategic plans. Where the programme feels it should continue with SUK it should release funds in tranches based on the delivery of specific small outputs. This could mean SUK would have to write a short concept for activities they expect to undertake every three months or so and cost those activities. The next tranche would then be released after the previous quarter's tranche has been fully accounted for and results demonstrated.
- v. FIC should reconsidering working with TMLC to support it enhance its relationship with unions. Furthermore, the programme could be sending members of partner unions to TMLC for their capacity building support.

8.2.2. Component 2

- vi. Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) should be incorporated/linked to BSED training to give youth impetus when they join the job market.
- vii. Business Development Services (BDS) especially backward and forward linkages should be made accessible to youth through linkages to add value to the current BSED training for youth.
- viii. The programme should enlist advocacy efforts to make opportunities meant for youth to be practically accessible e.g. the different affirmative action funds.
- ix. TYVA should do more by increasing its service portfolio and deepen its information dissemination activities to be more comprehensive.
- x. The programme should continue with building the capacity of partners to ensure organisational development and realisation of results and positioning themselves for the future.
- xi. Data management function should verify and clarify data with a view to guarding the integrity of the beneficiary data from youth organisations in Tanzania

8.2.3. Components 1 & 2

- xii. FIC should move fast to have coordinators sign formal contracts to correct any anomaly and maintain the good organisational practices it is promoting among its partners.
- xiii. FIC should invest in staff development to guarantee quality implementation and continuous learning in specific areas for both components.
- xiv. The programme should employ competitive tendering (involving thorough demonstration of capacity and commitment) to identify partners for a significant proportion of its funds and a smaller proportion of funds to designated partners identified through direct negotiations and whose selection should be based on strategic advantage.
- xv. The programme should support partner organisations by developing standard training toolkits especially for unions. The toolkit could be a trainer's case/box fully equipped with standard training materials and teaching aids. This is important for quality control. Such a box could be deposited at the union's office and only borrowed by shop stewards on a need basis. Link it to TMLC.
- xvi. FIC should deepen educating coordinators and partners alike on the rules governing their partnership engagement rules and strictly enforce the same rules.

8.3. Future of Programme Management in the Region

- xvii. In view of the anticipated closure of the FIC Nairobi office, FIC should have one senior programme specialist who is both technically competent and culturally agile to provide requisite technical backstopping support and ensure quality control, while stationed in the region. Such a programme specialist could work from home to avoid paying for office.
- xviii. FIC as an organization should develop a strategy for East Africa based on the needs of the region's target population and FIC's desire to continue contributing to development of East Africa through improved working conditions and access to employment opportunities.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

International Labour Organisation: http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/multimedia/maps-and-charts/WCMS_233936/lang--en/index.htm. Accessed 10 May 2017.

PEGASUS: <http://www.youthemploymentdecade.org/en/repor/youth-unemployment-national-priority-tanzania/> Accessed 10 May 2017.

International Trade Unions Confederation: The World's Worst Countries for Workers. http://www.ituc-csi.org/IMG/pdf/survey_ra_2016_eng.pdf. Accessed 10 May 2017.

Decent Work and Labour Rights in East Africa FIC, Flagligt Internationalt Centre, October 2013.

Programme Document: Decent Work and Labour Rights in East Africa 2014.

Programme Progress Reports

Partners' Strategic Plans.

Activity Reports.

ANNEXES

a.) Success Story: Kenya Shipping, Clearing and Warehousing Workers' Union

Kenya shipping, clearing and warehouses workers union, is a legal organization registered under Trade Unions' Act. The union was registered in 1989. The partnership between KSCWWU and FIC began in the year 2012-2014 under the young workers project, after the young workers project the union again entered into an agreement with FIC to partner in **Decent work and Labour rights in East Africa program 2015-2016**. During the program period, the union went through various trainings and activities which were successful and of benefit to both members and officials. Some of the trainings for members and officials included:

- CBA training and negotiation skills
- Training shop stewards on grievance and dispute handling
- Financial management and resource mobilization
- Organizing and recruitment workshop
- Communication skills
- Training of occupational safety and health at work place
- Developed operational strategic plan of four years.

KSCWWU had experienced challenges in retaining and recruitment of new members, this was because of the past leadership that was alleged to be corrupt, weak and incompetent. Never the less KSCWWU in partnership with **FIC** has made a milestone of recruiting new members despite the challenges that were there.

In the year 2015, the base membership of KSCWWU was 250. This number was not sustainable to the daily operations of the union. After the training of the TOTs in matter on safety & health, work injury benefit, grievance & dispute handling, benefit of CBA and campaigns on labour rights to the workers, KSCWWU managed to raise its membership to a significant number of 750. The union is now slowly gaining its strength and hope that for the coming years KSCWWU will be strong like other giant unions.

b.) Success Story: Ayub Mlahagwa (26), Tanzania

The success story of a young entrepreneur, Ayub G. Mlahagwa (26) is entertaining to hear. Before attending the BSED training, Ayub Mlahagwa admits that he had no idea on how he could improve his living, due to the fact that he had no reliable income, save for a small round weighing machine which he used to record the weights of people, earning him a paltry 3,000/= per day (e.g. 90,000/= per month). Having attended the BSED Training in Temeke, Dar es Salaam for one month, Ayub now talks a different story. He says he did not know that he had some hidden talents which he admits have been revealed through the entrepreneurship training.

Through these hidden talents, the young entrepreneur says, he has now launched a photography business, farming at Mkuranga where he grows water melons and making decorations for wedding parties and other occasions. Through these economic activities, Ayub says, he now earns a total of 200,000/= per month (2,400,000/=). "This has greatly improved my living, as I have now bought a plot for one million shillings where I intend to build my residence", says the young entrepreneur. Apart from this, he says, he has now started processing the registration of his company, adding that he sees the future as very bright as he intends to expand these activities to reach a stage where he can create employment. Commenting on the training, Ayub encourages the youth to take up the training seriously, as he believes that through it many youth are going to benefit and by acting on its guidelines they are greatly going to improve their living.

c.) Success Story: Open Mind Tanzania

Open Mind Tanzania (OMT) is a professional, non-political, not for profit, non-religious and service oriented non-governmental Organization Registered by the Ministry of Home Affairs with Certificate Number **SO. 15518**, under the Socialites Act **CAP 337 R.E. 2002**. It is a team of motivated young professionals who are determined to see changes in the economic and social status of the Tanzanian public (especially the youth). From June 2006 to the

present, we are fighting to make the Tanzanians able to identify and use the present legal opportunities to achieve moral, social and economic development.

OMT aims to change the world into a better place to live for human beings, whereby love and the sense of humanity becomes the core drive towards unity and alliance in fighting to achieve moral and economic development for all the people especially youth.

To achieve the above vision, OMT brings together all the Tanzanian youth to volunteer in fighting endlessly and actively to create a liveable world in which all the people can use the available legal opportunities to achieve better life and become well protected against injustice, poverty, ignorance and infections.

Within the Decent Work and Labour Rights Programme in Tanzania OMT plays a role in Business Skills and Entrepreneurship Development trainings and mentoring sessions coupled with entrepreneurship forums. In order to implement properly these activities several capacity building sessions were offered to the leaders, officers and members of OMT.

Capacity building trainings conducted to OMT from 2013 prior to the commitment of the programme. From these sessions OMT managed to put in place thirteen documents in form of policies, guidelines or directives. Also structures (organogram) of the organization were enhanced.

Further during the programme activities in 2014-17 more capacity buildings were provided in areas of finance, organizational development, resource mobilization, networking just to mention a few. From all these the performance of OMT as organization or its individuals has become tremendous.

1. Our trust in the Ministry concerning youth is high. OMT was chosen to represent Tanzanian youth in Commonwealth Youth Forum, Open Government Partnership (OGP) and East Africa Youth Forum.
2. OMT on registration managed to comply with NGO Act, 24. RE: 2002 and awarded certificate number 00NGO/0008896.
3. Due to our high performance SNV of the Netherlands Contracted OMT as local service provider for its youth programme.
4. An external international organization (accreditation scheme) named Molly's Network conducted an assessment to OMT in March, 2015. The results were out in July and OMT was named as Highly Potential organization. And last year 2016 OMT was fully accredited.
5. Reports are better written and projects better managed.
6. Financial systems are functioning better, M&E system in collecting data is improved and accurate.
7. Four Individual OMT members were able to get individual consultancies in developing policies for other organizations in Tanzania especially parliamentarian NGOs, thanks to the knowledge and skills in policy developing we got in 2013 capacity building trainings.
8. The board now is engaged more in supervision of NGO activities.

Changes were also observed in terms of number of projects and funds managed. In 2013 we were managing less than 20 million per year, but last year 2016 we have managed almost 80 million. All these thanks to the programme Decent Work and Labour rights in East Africa under Forum of International Cooperation.

d.) Terms of Reference

Terms of Reference
End-Review of the program:
“Decent work and labour rights in East Africa, phase 1”

Background

The programme “Decent work and Labour Rights in East Africa” (hereafter DWLRP) is a 3 year program (2014-17) implemented by youth organisations and trade unions, that are aiming at improving working conditions for workers and increasing and improving job opportunities for youth.

1.1 The overall objective of the program is “The employment conditions in Kenya and Tanzania have improved and youth has access to decent employment in line with existing national and international labour laws and regulations.”

The immediate objectives of the program are:

- iv. The strengthened capacity of partner trade unions in Kenya and Tanzania to advocate for and create awareness about workers’ rights and respect of labour market legislation contributes to improved working conditions.
- v. The strengthened capacity of partner youth organisations in Kenya and Tanzania to create awareness and to advocate for increased and improved job opportunities for youth has contributed to better conditions for establishing sustainable businesses and increased success in their job seeking.

The program thus aims to address challenges related to employment and to the labour market faced by youth and members of trade unions in Kenya and Tanzania. The partners work towards ensuring that labour rights in Kenya and Tanzania are upheld, especially for the vulnerable and poor with low income and that those with little opportunities in society are empowered and that their conditions and opportunities at the labour market are improved. Geographically the program focuses on Kenya and Tanzania in and around bigger cities (Dar, Mombasa, Kisumu and Nairobi). The program activities are implemented in Nairobi, Kisumu and Mombasa counties and Dar es Salam city. It is envisioned that the activities of both components in the same areas also create a synergy which will ensure better results with regards to decent employment and better job opportunities in the 4 geographical areas.

The program will come to an end in March 2017, however the experiences from the current program and especially from the Midterm Review, has been included into development of an application for a second phase of the program applied for in December 2016 and set to start in April 2017.

End-Review

The End-Review will take place in February and March 2017 and will be conducted by an external consultant from either Kenya or Tanzania. The final recommendations from the review will build on the findings from the Midterm review conducted in April 2016, with additional studies of relevant program documents and reports and a shorter field visit to Mombasa, Kisumu and Dar es Salaam to view the program progress since the Midterm Review.

Objective of the review

The objective of the review is to assess the overall progress of the program results as well as assessing the strategy applied.

The report will respond to the 5 DAC criteria that are defined below with related questions:

Criteria Evaluation issues	Questions
Effectiveness “The extent to which the objectives were achieved, or are expected to be achieved, taking into account their relative importance”.	To what degree is the program likely to succeed in meeting its objectives? What specific results, both intended and unintended have been achieved through the program up till now? (According to the outputs and outcomes described in the program LFA) Effectiveness in reporting and implementation of activities
Relevance The extent to which the objectives of a development intervention are consistent with beneficiaries’ requirement, country needs, global priorities and partners’ and donors’ policies”.	Is the program relevant to the target group’s needs and requirements? Is the program strategy the right strategy to achieve the objectives? What is the relevance of the partners that have been selected and of the approach taken to the operationalization of the Strategy?
Efficiency “A measure of how economically resources/inputs (funds, expertise, time, etc.) are converted to results	Has the funding been spent in an optimal way to obtain results? Has the program spent money on activities that benefit the target group?
Sustainability The degree to which the processes started and results obtained can be expected to remain in place after program completion.”	What measures have been taken to make the program sustainable? Do these measures seem realistic and what are the chances that the initiatives will continue? What factors are influencing the efforts to make the program sustainable? In what way is the involvement of the local governments ensuring the sustainability? The replicability of the program: Given that the interventions may be implemented in other locations, how is the assessment of the replicability?
Impact The lasting changes – positive as well as negative, planned as well as unplanned – arising from the program.	What is likely to be the impact of the different interventions of the program in a longer perspective? In what way is the program influencing the lives of the target group? How have the advocacy initiatives influenced the situation of the target group?

The review is to focus on all questions mentioned under the DAC criteria, including results within all expected output and outcome indicators. It is expected that the review will put a certain emphasis of the areas of capacity building of partners and implementation of advocacy activities, as mentioned below:

In both components additional attention is paid to:

- How does FIC add value to partners work and implementation
 - An assessment of the partners' capacity? Are the capacity of the partners progressing in line with the capacity building activities implemented
- 1 An assessment of the advocacy strategy and the implementation of the same carried out by the partners. Is the advocacy effective, and is it likely to create a future impact?
 - 2 What lessons can be learned for the future program?

Methods

The evaluation will be conducted by an external consultant in such a way that it will ensure mutual involvement and learning amongst the implementing partners of the program. The consultant will build on the program application and finding from the Midterm Review conducted in April 2016, and use documents already available, including sustainability strategies, advocacy strategies, and minutes from cluster meetings, curricula, and the program monitoring reports such as: LFA, Outcome mapping reports and Overall Program Monitoring reports. The consultant will develop an inception report including tools and interview guides to be used for the field visits. Further the inception report will include a detailed plan for the End- review, which will be developed in close cooperation with the involved partner organisations and FIC Nairobi. The inception report should be approved by FIC before starting the field work.

The consultant will conduct personal as well as focus group interviews with representatives of the program beneficiaries who has participated in program activities and trainings, partners and staff, representatives from the clusters, and relevant stakeholders including local authorities.

The program coordinators of FIC in Nairobi will assist the consultant when needed and ensure that the consultant complies with the framework stipulated in these Terms of Reference.

Procedure of the review

In January 2017 FIC will employ an external consultant to carry out the end-review. The review will take place in February and March 2017. It is expected that the field work is carried out in the beginning of March 2017, including 3 days travel to Mombasa, 3 days to Dar es Salaam, 1 day to Kisumu and 1 day in Nairobi. The external consultant will present the results and recommendations to FIC and partners, who will be able to provide relevant input for the final review report. By end of March, the external consultant will submit the final report to FIC and partners.

Procedure for submission of interest:

All interested consultants should submit their proposal to FIC Nairobi coordinator Festus Ouko before January 20th 2017, 10 AM, on email: Erustus Ouko <erustusf@gmail.com>. The proposals need to include a letter of interest describing how the consultancy will be conducted and a CV of the consultant who will conduct the review. Proposals submitted after the deadline will not be considered. Interviews with consultants will be conducted during the last week of January. Consultants applying for the consultancy should be available to conduct field visits to Mombasa, Dar and Kisumu within a maximum of 8 days during the first 2 weeks of March 2017.

Activity plan

Below follows a more detailed plan on the timing and division of responsibilities concerning each activity of the review:

Activity	Time	Responsible
Announcement for an external consultant to conduct the Midterm Review	Between January 10 th and 20 th 2017	
Final deadline for submission of letter of interest	January 20 th , 10 AM 2017	
Interviews with potential consultants	30 and 31 st of January 2017	FIC Nairobi
Consultant contracted	Before February 3 rd 2017	FIC Nairobi
An inception report describing the Midterm review survey and report, methods to be used for collection of qualitative and quantitative data, including sampling size, numbers interviewed and criteria for selection of persons to be interviewed/ answering questionnaires. Interview guides/ questionnaires is developed and submitted to FIC for approval together with the inception report.	Before February 14 th 2017	External consultant
Comments are provided by FIC, the inception report should be approved by FIC	Before February 27 th 2017	FIC Nairobi and Denmark
Desk review of relevant documents conducted	February 2017	
All agreements with people to be interviewed/respondents to questionnaires' are made by FIC in line with the criteria's for selection of respondents developed by the consultant.	Before February 23 rd 2017	FIC Nairobi
The field work is carried out within a total of 8 working days for 1 person	In the period between February 28 th - March 10 th 2017	External consultant
The main results and findings from the review are presented to FIC on Skype	March 20 th 2017	External consultant
A draft report is submitted to FIC	March 22 nd 2017	External consultant
FIC and partners provide written comments to the report	By March 24 th 2017	FIC Denmark, Nairobi and Partners
The final review report is submitted to FIC	By March 28 th 2017	External consultant